

The Allergic Asthma Phenotype

Michael Schatz, MD, MS^a, and Lanny Rosenwasser, MD^b *San Diego, Calif; and Kansas City, Mo*

INFORMATION FOR CATEGORY 1 CME CREDIT

Credit can now be obtained, free for a limited time, by reading the review articles in this issue. Please note the following instructions.

Method of Physician Participation in Learning Process: The core material for these activities can be read in this issue of the Journal or online at the *JACI: In Practice* Web site: www.jaci-inpractice.org/. The accompanying tests may only be submitted online at www.jaci-inpractice.org/. Fax or other copies will not be accepted.

Date of Original Release: November 2014. Credit may be obtained for these courses until December 31, 2015.

Copyright Statement: Copyright 2014-2016. All rights reserved.

Overall Purpose/Goal: To provide excellent reviews on key aspects of allergic disease to those who research, treat, or manage allergic disease.

Target Audience: Physicians and researchers within the field of allergic disease.

Accreditation/Provider Statements and Credit Designation: The American Academy of Allergy, Asthma & Immunology (AAAAI) is

accredited by the Accreditation Council for Continuing Medical Education (ACCME) to provide continuing medical education for physicians. The AAAAI designates these educational activities for a maximum of 1 AMA PRA Category 1 Credit. Physicians should only claim credit commensurate with the extent of their participation in the activity.

List of Design Committee Members: Michael Schatz, MD, MS, and Lanny Rosenwasser, MD

Activity Objectives

1. To appreciate the characteristics of the allergic asthma phenotype.
2. To identify patients with the allergic asthma phenotype.

Recognition of Commercial Support: This CME has not received external commercial support.

Disclosure of Significant Relationships with Relevant Commercial Companies/Organizations: L. Rosenwasser is president of the World Allergy Organization. M. Schatz declares that he has no relevant conflicts of interest.

Allergic asthma is the most common asthma phenotype. It usually is defined by the presence of sensitization to environmental allergens, although a clinical correlation between exposure and symptoms further supports the diagnosis. The average age of onset of allergic asthma is younger than that of nonallergic asthma. Although the spectrum of allergic asthma may vary from mild to severe, studies have reported that allergic versus nonallergic asthma is less severe. There is an increased prevalence of allergic rhinoconjunctivitis and atopic dermatitis in patients with allergic asthma. Total IgE levels usually are higher in allergic versus nonallergic asthma, but levels substantially overlap between the 2 groups. Increased Th2 cytokines have been demonstrated in secretions and peripheral blood of patients with allergic asthma. Atopy has been reported to be inversely associated with persistent airflow obstruction and airway remodeling. Clusters with a high prevalence of early onset atopic asthma have been frequently

reported in statistical phenotyping studies, but the various clusters of patients with atopy were quite heterogeneous in terms of symptom severity, pulmonary function, and tendency for exacerbations. Implications for future research regarding the allergic asthma phenotype are described. © 2014 American Academy of Allergy, Asthma & Immunology (*J Allergy Clin Immunol Pract* 2014;2:645-8)

Key words: Asthma; Allergic asthma; Asthma phenotypes; Allergic sensitization

Allergic asthma can be defined clinically by identifying (1) allergic sensitization and (2) a correlation between allergen exposure and asthma symptoms. The first criterion is more objective and straightforward, whereas the second depends on whether or not appropriate questions are asked of the patient and the patient's ability to accurately link exposures to the onset of symptoms. Literature that compares allergic to nonallergic asthma, and thus identifies the specific characteristics of this phenotype, usually uses only the first criterion, although inclusion of the second criterion would increase the specificity of the definition. A positive antigen inhalation challenge could be considered to further confirm this phenotype, but this is not clinically practical and has not been used in the allergic asthma phenotype literature.

DEMOGRAPHICS

Allergic asthma is probably the most common asthma phenotype in the general population of patients with asthma.¹ Allergic asthma may present at any age, but cohorts of patients

^aDepartment of Allergy, Kaiser Permanente, San Diego, Calif

^bDepartments of Pediatrics and Medicine, University of Missouri-Kansas City School of Medicine, Kansas City, Mo

No funding was received for this work.

Conflicts of interest: L Rosenwasser is president of the World Allergy Organization. M. Schatz declares that he has no relevant conflicts of interest.

Received for publication July 7, 2014; revised September 9, 2014; accepted for publication September 10, 2014.

Corresponding author: Michael Schatz, MD, MS, Department of Allergy, Kaiser Permanente Medical Center, 7060 Clairemont Mesa Blvd, San Diego, CA 92111. E-mail: Michael.x.schatz@kp.org.

2213-2198

© 2014 American Academy of Allergy, Asthma & Immunology

<http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jaip.2014.09.004>

Abbreviation used*FENO- Fraction of exhaled nitric oxide*

with allergic asthma are younger than those with nonallergic asthma.¹⁻⁴ Allergic asthma is more common in male patients, whereas nonallergic asthma is more common in female patients.¹ There is no difference in smoking prevalence in these 2 phenotypes.^{1,2}

CLINICAL CHARACTERISTICS

The onset of allergic versus nonallergic asthma occurs at a younger age.^{1,2,5,6} In 1 study, the mean age of onset was 15.8 years of age in allergic versus 32.2 years of age in nonallergic asthma.¹ Conversely, atopy is less common in later-onset asthma.⁷ Analysis of some data suggests that a family history of asthma is more common with allergic versus nonallergic asthma,² whereas other studies do not confirm this observation.⁸ Patients with allergic asthma may have either intermittent or persistent asthma and may or may not be more “brittle” or prone to exacerbations.^{9,10} They are more likely than those with nonallergic asthma to report seasonal variations of their symptoms.¹ Patients with allergy and with asthma may be classified as having “few, moderate, or high” symptoms,¹¹ and cohorts of difficult-to-control or severe asthma include individuals with allergy.¹²⁻¹⁴ However, studies of patients with varying degrees of asthma severity report that allergic versus nonallergic asthma is less severe^{1,2,5,15-18} or that there is no association between severity and atopic status.¹⁹⁻²² Other reports suggest that patients with allergic versus nonallergic asthma have less need for oral glucocorticosteroids.^{1,2} In contrast, a study of severe asthma in school-age children demonstrates that those with severe asthma have significantly greater sensitization to aeroallergens than children with mild-to-moderate asthma.²³ Exercise-induced bronchospasm is reported to occur more frequently and be more severe with allergic versus nonallergic asthma.²⁴

COMORBIDITIES

There is an increased prevalence of allergic rhinoconjunctivitis and atopic dermatitis in patients with allergic asthma.¹ However, there are no differences in the prevalence of rhinitis symptoms between patients with allergic versus those with nonallergic asthma, the latter of whom presumably have nonallergic rhinitis.¹ Nasal polyps and chronic rhinosinusitis are less common with allergic versus nonallergic asthma.¹

BIOMARKERS

Most persons with asthma, regardless of phenotype, have a predisposition toward Th2 inflammation in the airway due to innate factors, such as thymic stromal lymphopoietin, IL-25, and IL-33.²⁵ Subjects with allergic asthma, by definition, demonstrate allergic sensitization (allergen-specific IgE), although allergic sensitization probably represents a more important factor in triggering exacerbations than in induction of disease. Total IgE levels usually are higher in allergic versus nonallergic asthma,^{2,24} but separation of these 2 phenotypes cannot be solely based on total serum IgE levels because of substantial overlap between the 2 groups.

Peripheral blood eosinophilia may be seen in allergic or nonallergic asthma and may correlate with airway obstruction²⁶ and predict exacerbations.²⁷ Some studies have demonstrated higher levels of peripheral eosinophilia in patients with allergic versus those with nonallergic asthma.²⁸ Th2-polarized responses, measured as higher mean IL-5 and IL-13 production and lower ratios of INF- γ and IL-12 to 3 Th2 cytokines (IL-4, IL-5, or IL-13), were reported in the peripheral blood of participants with allergic asthma in the Detroit Childhood Allergy Study.²⁸ Secretions from the airways of patients with allergic asthma also contain increased Th2 cytokines as well as eosinophils and mast cell mediators.³ Positive allergen challenges are associated with an increase in fraction of exhaled nitric oxide (FENO). Some studies report no association between atopy and persistent airflow obstruction²⁹ or excessive FEV₁ decline,³⁰ but another study shows less atopy in patients with versus those without persistent airflow limitation.³¹ Similarly, a 2014 study shows a greater decline in pulmonary function in a less atopic, late-onset group compared with an early onset, atopic cohort.³² Less remodeling by computerized tomography in allergic versus nonallergic patients is also reported.³³

RELATIONSHIP TO STATISTICALLY DEFINED PHENOTYPES

Statistical attempts to define asthma phenotypes usually have identified at least 1 allergic phenotype.^{1-14,31,34-39} In these studies, early onset disease and atopy typically go together,^{12,14,34,35,37-39} and atopy did not distinguish the phenotypes identified in a cohort with adult-onset asthma.³⁷ The reported studies describe various associations with the atopic phenotypes. Halder et al³⁴ studied primary and secondary care cohorts and identified an early onset, atopic cluster in both samples. Those in the atopic cohorts demonstrated more FEV₁ reversibility, higher sputum eosinophil and FENO levels, and more exacerbations in the past year compared with the other clusters. Siroux et al³⁵ identified clusters in 2 large European epidemiologic studies conducted with adults. They identified 2 atopic cohorts, 1 that was being actively treated and manifested increased IgE levels, bronchial hyperreactivity, and exacerbations, and the other that was characterized as “inactive-mild untreated.”

Boudier et al¹¹ conducted a 10-year follow-up of cluster-based phenotypes in a pooled analysis of 3 adult cohorts and identified 4 atopic clusters, distinguished each from the other primarily by the severity of symptoms. The most symptomatic atopic cluster also demonstrated higher levels of IgE, increased bronchial hyperreactivity, and an increased frequency of exacerbations compared with the other clusters. Howrylak et al⁴⁰ reported the application of spectral clustering to clinical data from 1041 children with asthma who participated in the Childhood Asthma Management Program study. Four of the 5 clusters were moderately to highly atopic. These clusters differed from each other in their level of airway obstruction and rates of exacerbations.

Four studies applied statistical methods to identify clusters in patients with severe or difficult-to-treat asthma. Moore et al¹² presented a cluster analysis of participants ages 12 years old or older in the Severe Asthma Research Program, which includes some individuals with mild and moderate asthma. More than 75% of the subjects were atopic in 3 of the 5 clusters. Two of these clusters had normal pulmonary function and low health care utilization, whereas the third atopic cluster was more likely

TABLE 1. Allergens that have been associated with allergic asthma

Cockroach
Dander (cat, dog)
House dust mite (<i>Dermatophagoides pteronyssinus</i> , <i>Dermatophagoides farina</i>)
Mold spores (<i>Alternaria</i> , <i>Cladosporium</i> [<i>Hormodendrum</i>], <i>Helminthosporium</i> , <i>Aspergillus</i> , <i>Penicillium</i>)
Pollens (regional tree, grass, and weed pollens)

to have severe asthma with reduced pulmonary function and more health care utilization. A more recent report from the Severe Asthma Research Program of 378 subjects includes 89 healthy controls and results of inflammatory variables that were determined at bronchoscopy.³⁹ Four of the 5 asthma clusters had skin test reactivity to multiple allergens. These atopic clusters differed from each other based on symptom severity, use of oral corticosteroids, pulmonary function, FENO values, and bronchoalveolar lavage fluid eosinophilia. The less atopic cluster contained individuals with later onset, mostly severe asthma, and 80% reported nasal polyps.³⁹ Fitzpatrick et al¹³ evaluated clusters in children ages 6 to 17 years old enrolled in the Severe Asthma Research Program and found that participants in 3 of 4 clusters were atopic. The 3 atopic clusters were differentiated by the level of lung function; the cluster with advanced airflow limitation was more intensively treated and demonstrated higher FENO levels and more health care utilization than the other clusters.

Finally, a cluster analysis for phenotypes was reported from The Epidemiology and Natural History of Asthma: Outcomes and Treatment Regimens cohort of children and adults with severe or difficult-to-control asthma.¹⁴ In this study, specific IgE was not measured, and atopy was inferred based on the number of “allergic” triggers and the presence of allergy comorbidities (allergic rhinitis, atopic dermatitis). Four of 5 clusters in the The Epidemiology and Natural History of Asthma: Outcomes and Treatment Regimens children cohort were mostly atopic, distinguished from each other by predominance of white race, female sex, passive smoke exposure, and nonwhite race. Two of 5 clusters in adults could be considered atopic because the prevalence of 3 or more allergic triggers was >65% and the prevalence of allergic rhinitis was >80%. These 2 atopic adult cohorts were differentiated from each other by a higher total serum IgE in one and aspirin sensitivity in the other. The atopic aspirin sensitive cluster manifested poorer quality of life and experienced more frequent asthma exacerbations than those in other clusters. In summary, clusters with a high prevalence of early onset, atopic asthma have been frequently reported in the statistical phenotyping studies to date. However, the various clusters of patients with atopy were quite heterogeneous in terms of symptom severity, pulmonary function, and tendency for exacerbations.

DEFINITION

Two elements are recommended as necessary to identify the allergic asthma phenotype: (1) allergic sensitization and (2) symptoms in response to allergen exposure:

- Allergic sensitization: Specific IgE (demonstrated by skin prick-puncture tests or specific IgE *in vitro* tests) to at least one of an appropriate panel of allergens (Table 1).

- Symptoms in response to allergen exposure: Seasonal variation (not due to infection) and/or symptoms when exposed to freshly cut grass, house dust, molds, cats, dogs, or other fur-bearing animals. Allergic sensitization to these allergens also should be demonstrated.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR INFORMATION TO BE OBTAINED TO DETERMINE PHENOTYPES (RELATED TO ALLERGIC ASTHMA)

1. Immediate family history of allergy and asthma
2. Age of onset
3. Sex
4. Occupation
5. Personal history of allergic rhinitis, food allergy, atopic dermatitis
6. History and/or presence of nasal polyps
7. History and/or presence of sinusitis
8. Potential allergic triggers, including seasonal variation and symptoms when exposed to freshly cut grass, house dust, molds, and animals
9. Clinical markers of severity (prior hospitalizations, other unscheduled visits, oral glucocorticosteroid use)
10. Clinical markers of severity and/or control (symptoms, activity limitation, FEV₁)
11. Specific IgE tests (Table 1)

RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND FUTURE DIRECTIONS

1. Effect of allergic sensitization on other phenotypes (severity, response to therapy, prognosis)
2. Prevention of allergic asthma (prevention of sensitization and prevention of the “allergic march”)
3. Proportion of total patients with asthma and with “probable allergic asthma” (evidence of sensitization)
4. Relationship of the presence versus absence of clinical correlation (seasonal symptoms or symptoms in response to allergens) to severity, response to therapy, and prognosis
5. Comparison of asthma severity, response to therapy, and prognosis in patients with seasonal versus perennial allergic asthma
6. Biomarkers (beyond allergic sensitization) specific for the allergic asthma phenotype

CONCLUSION

Allergic asthma is a common asthma phenotype with distinctive clinical and biomarker characteristics. It can be defined based on the presence of allergic sensitization but may overlap with other phenotypes. It is heterogeneous regarding intensity of treatment required, clinical course, and outcomes. Further understanding of this phenotype should facilitate improved targeted therapy for patients with more severe forms of allergic asthma.

REFERENCES

1. Romanet-Manent S, Charpin D, Magnan A, Lanteaume A, Vervloet D, for the EGEA Cooperative Group. Allergic vs. nonallergic asthma: what makes the difference. *Allergy* 2002;57:607-13.
2. Kanani AS, Broder I, Greene JM, Tarlo SM. Correlation between nasal symptoms and asthma severity in patients with atopic and nonatopic asthma. *Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol* 2005;94:341-62.

3. Novak N, Bieber T. Allergic and non-allergic forms of atopic diseases. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2003;112:252-62.
4. Wenzel SE. Asthma: defining of the persistent adult phenotypes. *Lancet* 2006; 368:804-13.
5. Kitch BT, Levy BD, Fanta CH. Late onset asthma: epidemiology diagnosis and treatment. *Drugs Aging* 2000;17:385097.
6. de Carvalho-Pinto RM, Cukier A, Angelini L, Antonangelo L, Mauad T, Dolhnikoff M, et al. Clinical characteristics and possible phenotypes of an adult severe asthma population. *Resp Med* 2012;106:47-56.
7. Hsu J-Y, Ling S-L, Kuo BI-T, Chiang C-D. Age of onset and the characteristics of asthma. *Respirology* 2004;8:369-72.
8. Pirson F, Charpin D, Sansonetti M, Lanteaume A, Kulling G, Charpin J, et al. Is intrinsic asthma a hereditary disease? *Allergy* 1991;46:367-71.
9. Gupta D, Ayres JG. Brittle asthma: a separate clinical phenotype of asthma. *Indian J Chest Dis Allied Sci* 2001;43:33-8.
10. Graziani E, Petroianini A, Terzano C. Brittle asthma. *Eur Rev Med Pharmacol Sci* 2004;8:135-8.
11. Boudier A, Curjuric I, Basagana X, Hazgui H, Anto AM, Bousquet J, et al. Ten-year follow-up of cluster-based asthma phenotypes in adults. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2013;188:550-60.
12. Moore WC, Meyers DA, Wenzel SE, Teague WG, Li H, Li X, et al. Identification of asthma phenotypes using cluster analysis in the Severe Asthma Research Program. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2010;181:315-23.
13. Fitzpatrick AM, Teague WG, Meyers DA, Peters SP, Li X, Li H, et al. Heterogeneity of severe asthma in childhood. Conformation by cluster analysis of children in the National Institutes of Health/National Heart Lung and Blood Institute Severe Asthma Research Program. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2011;127:382-9.
14. Schatz M, Hsu JW, Zeiger RS, Chen W, Dorenbaum A, Chipps BE, et al. Phenotypes determined by cluster analysis in severe or difficult-to-treat asthma. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2014;133:1549-56.
15. The ENFUMOSA Study Group. The ENFUMOSA cross-sectional European multicenter study of the clinical phenotype of chronic severe asthma. *Eur Respir J* 2003;22:470-7.
16. Gaga M, Papageorgiou N, Yiorgiotti G, Karydi P, Liapikou A, Bitsakou H, et al. Risk factors and characteristics associated with severe and difficult to treat asthma phenotype: an analysis of the ENFUMOSA group of patients based on the SCRHS questionnaire. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2005;35:954-9.
17. Moore WC, Bleecker ER, Curran-Everett D, Erzurum SC, Ameredes BT, Bacharier L, et al. Characterization of the severe asthma phenotype by the National Heart, Lung, and Blood Institute's Severe Asthma Research Program. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2007;119:405-13.
18. Amelink M, de Groot JC, de Nijs SB, Lutter R, Zwinderman AH, Sterk PJ, et al. Severe adult-onset asthma: a distinct phenotype. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2013; 132:336-41.
19. Cline MG, Dodge R, Lebowitz MD, Burrows B. Determinants of percent predicted FEV1 in current asthmatics subjects. *Chest* 1994;106:1089-93.
20. Siroux V, Oryszczyant M-P, Paty E, Kauffmann F, Pison C, Vervloet D, et al. Relationships of allergic sensitization, total immunoglobulin E and blood eosinophils to asthma severity in children of the EGEA Study. *Clin Exp Allergy* 2003;33:746-51.
21. Liou A, Grubb J, Schechtman K, Hamilos DL. Causative and contributive factors to asthma severity and patterns of medications use in patients seeking specialized asthma care. *Chest* 2003;124:1781-8.
22. Fukutomi Y, Taniguchi M, Tsuburai T, Tanimoto H, Oshikata C, Ono E, et al. Obesity and aspirin intolerance are risk factors for difficult-to-treat asthma in Japanese non-atopic women. *Clinical and Experimental Allergy* 2012;42: 738-46.
23. Fitzpatrick AM, Gaston BM, Erzurum SC, Teague WG, for the NIH/NHLBI Severe Asthma Research Program. Features of severe asthma in school-age children: atopy and increased exhaled nitric oxide. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2006;118:1218-25.
24. Virdkow J-C, Kroegel C, Walker C, Matthys H. Cellular and immunological markers of allergic and intrinsic bronchial asthma. *Lung* 1994;172:313-4.
25. Scanlon ST, McKenzie AN. Type 2 innate lymphoid cells: new players in asthma and allergy. *Curr Opin Immunol* 2012;24:707-12.
26. Horn BR, Robin ED, Theodore J, Van Kessel AV. Total eosinophil counts in the management of bronchial asthma. *N Engl J Med* 1975;292:1152-5.
27. Zeiger RS, Schatz M, Li Q, Chen W, Khatri DB, Gossage D, et al. Blood eosinophil count is a risk factor for future asthma exacerbations in adult persistent asthma. *J Allergy Clin Immunol Pract* 2014;2:741-50.
28. Zoratti E, Havstad S, Wegienka G, Nicholas C, Bobbitt KR, Woodcroft KJ, et al. Differentiating asthma phenotypes in young adults through polyclonal cytokine profiles. *Ann Allergy Asthma Immunol* 2014;113:25-30.
29. Bumbacea D, Campbell D, Nguyen L, Carr D, Barnes PH, Robinson D, et al. Parameters associated with persistent airflow obstruction in chronic asthma. *Eur Resp J* 2004;24:122.
30. van Vee IH, ten Brinke A, Sterk PJ, Sont JK, Gauw SA, Rabe KF, et al. Exhaled nitric oxide predicts lung function decline in difficult-to-treat asthma. *Eur Respir J* 2008;32:344-9.
31. Lee JH, Haselkorn T, Borish L, Rasouliyan L, Chipps BE, Wenzel SE. Risk factors associated with persistent airflow limitation in severe or difficult-to-treat asthma. *Chest* 2007;132:1882-9.
32. Sakagami T, Hasegawa T, Koya T, Furukawa T, Kawakami H, Kimura Y, et al. Cluster analysis identifies characteristic phenotypes of asthma with accelerated lung function decline. *J Asthma* 2014;51:113-8.
33. Paganin F, Senterre E, Chanez P, Carr D, Barnes PJ, Robinson D, et al. Computed tomography of the lungs in asthma: influence of disease severity and etiology. *Am J Resp Crit Care Med* 1996;153:110-4.
34. Haldar P, Pavord ID, Shaw DE, Berry M, Thomas M, Brightling CE, et al. Cluster analysis and clinical asthma phenotypes. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2008;178:218-24.
35. Siroux V, Basagana X, Boudier A, Pin I, Garcia-Aymerich J, Vesin A, et al. Identifying adult asthma phenotypes using a cluster approach. *Eur Respir J* 2011;38:310-7.
36. Just J, Gouvis-Echraghi R, Couderc R, Guillemot-Lambert N, Saint-Pierre P. Novel severe wheezy young children phenotypes: boys atopic multiple-trigger and girls nonatopic uncontrolled wheeze. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2012;130:103-10.
37. Kim T-B, Jang A-S, Kwon H-S, Park J-S, Chang Y-S, Cho S-H, et al. Identification of asthma clusters in two independent Korean adult asthma cohorts. *Eur Respir J* 2013;41:1308-14.
38. Nagasaki T, Matsumoto H, Kanemitsu Y, Izuhara K, Tohda Y, Kita H, et al. Integrating longitudinal information on pulmonary function and inflammation using asthma phenotypes. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2014;133:1474-7.
39. Wu W, Bleecker E, Moore W, Busse WW, Castro M, Chung KF, et al. Un-supervised phenotyping of Severe Asthma Research Program participants using expanded lung data. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2014;133:1280-8.
40. Howrylak JA, Fuhlbrigge AL, Strunk RC, Zeiger RS, Weiss ST, Raby BA, et al. Classification of childhood asthma phenotypes and long-term clinical responses to inhaled anti-inflammatory medications. *J Allergy Clin Immunol* 2014;133: 1289-300.

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.